# Design: Lorenzo Ottaviani Design / NY

# www.pict-pcti.org

Log on to our website for news about all international courts and tribunals (judgments. press releases, articles, and more). This chart can also be downloaded from the PICT site.

## EXISTING

The date in parenthesis indicates the year in which the body started operating Note: this is not the date on which the agreement establishing the body was signed, nor necessaril the date of the agreement's

#### **■** EXTINCT

entry into force.

The dates in parenthesis indicate the period during which the body was in operation.

## ABORTED

Certain bodies, after having had their constitutive instruments adonted never started functioning The date in parenthesis indicates the year in which the constitutive instrument was adopted.

### DORMANT

Certain bodies, while formally still operating have not received any submission for several years.

## NASCENT

The date in parenthesis indicates the year in which the constitutive instrument was adopted.

#### PROPOSED

These are bodies whose establishment has been considered in the past by academics and law-makers but which have not yet become reality

## FXTINCT African Slave Trade Mixed

EXISTING

Tribunals (1819-1866 circa) International Military Tribunal at Nuremberg (1945-1946)

International Criminal

Law/Humanitarian Law

for the Former Yugoslavia (1993 →)

International Criminal Tribunal

International Criminal Tribunal

for Rwanda (1995 →)

International Military Tribunal for the Far East (1946-1948)

## ABORTED International Prize Court (1907)

NASCENT International Criminal Court (1998)

# **Human Rights**

## EXISTING

 European Court of Human Rights (1959-1998 / 1998 →) • Inter-American Court of Human Rights (1979 →)

## NASCENT

 African Court of Human and Peoples' Rights (1998)

## PROPOSED

• International Human Rights Court

## Trade, Commerce and Investments

#### EXISTING

• World Trade Organization Dispute Settlement Understanding (1995 →)

The DSU created a dispute settlemen system based on a standing political organ (the Dispute Settlement Body), comprising all members of the WTO, a set of ad hoc expert panels, and the Appellate Body. The reports of the Panels and the Appellate Body can be rejected by the DSB only by consensus Strictly speaking, only the Appellate Body belongs in this column, while the DSB and the panels should be listed in the section "Permanent Arbitral Tribunals/Conciliation Commissions"

## PROPOSED

International Loans Tribunal

## Regional Economic Integration Agreements

## Europe

# EXISTING

Court of Justice of the European Communities (1952 →) Benelux Economic Union Court

of Justice (1974 →) The Benelux College of Arbitrators has been listed in the section "Permanent Arbitral Tribunals / Conciliation Commissions"

 Court of First Instance of the European Communities (1988 →) The European Court of Auditors (1977→) is not quite an internation judicial body (see back). It is an internal control body of the

European Union. It examines

has been received, and the

whether EU budgetary revenue

corresponding expenditure incurred

DORMANT • European Nuclear Energy Tribunal (OECD) (1957)

> Western European Union Tribunal (1957)

EFTA Court (1994 →)

 European Tribunal on State Immunity (Council of Europe) (1972)

in a legal and regular manner

adjudicate disputes (although it

When auditors discover cases of

irregularities, including suspected

communicated to the Community

they may take appropriate action.

bodies responsible in order that

can render advisory opinions).

fraud, the information is

The Court does not formally

## Europe/Central Asia

## EXISTING

 Economic Court of the Commonwealt of Independent States (1993 →)

## Africa/Middle East

#### EXISTING

- Common Court of Justice and Arbitration of the Organization for the Harmonization of Corporate Law in Africa (1997 →)
- Court of Justice of the Common Market for Eastern and Southern Africa (1998 →)

#### EXTINCT

· East African Community Court of Appeal (1967-1977)

 East African Community Common Market Tribunal (1967-1977)

## DORMANT

 Economic Community of West African States Tribunal (1975) Judicial Board of the Organization of Arab Petroleum Exporting Countries (1980)

 Court of Justice of the Economic Community of Central African States (1983)

Court of Justice of the Arab Maghreb Union (1989) Court of Justice of the African

Economic Community (1991) Southern Africa Development Community Tribunal (1992)

## PROPOSED

International Islamic Court of Justice

Arab Court of Justice

## Latin America / Caribbean EXISTING

- Court of Justice of the Andean Community (1984 →)
- Central American Court of Justice "Corte Centroamericana de Justicia" (1994 →)

#### EXTINCT

 Central American Court of Justice "Corte de Justicia Centroamericana" (1908-1918)

## NASCENT

• Caribbean Court of Justice (2001)

## PROPOSED

MERCOSUR Court of Justice

 Inter-American Court of International Justice

# Quasi-Judicial, Implementation Control and other Dispute Settlement Bodies

## **Human Rights Bodies**

International Judicial Bodies

General Jurisdiction

Permanent Court of International

FXISTING

EXTINC

EXISTING

International Court

of Justice (1946 →)

Justice (1919-1945)

Law of the Sea

International Tribunal for the

Law of the Sea  $(1996 \rightarrow)$ 

Environment

International Court

for the Environment

PROPOSED

#### EXISTING

ILO Commission of Inquiry (1919 →)

 ILO Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations (1926 →)

 ILO Conference Committee on the Application of Conventions (1926 →)

 United Nations Commission on Human Rights (1946 →)

ILO Governing Body Committee on Freedom of Association (1950 →)

Committee of Independent Experts under the European Social Charter (1965 →)

Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (1969 →)

International Civil and Political Rights Committee (1976 →) Inter-American Commission

on Human Rights (1979 →) Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination

Against Women (1981 →) Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1987 →)

 Committee Against Torture (1987 →) African Commission on Human

and Peoples' Rights (1987 →) European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment  $(1989 \rightarrow)$ 

 Committee on the Rights of the Child (1990 →)

 European Commission Against Racism and Intolerance (1993 →) Human Rights Commission for Bosnia Herzegovina (1995 →)

## EXISTING

 Commission for Displaced Persons and Refugees (Bosnia Herzegovina) (1995 →)

 Commission to Preserve National Monuments

(Bosnia Herzegovina) (1995 →)

#### EXTINCT

• European Commission on Human Rights (1959-1998)

# EXISTING

• International Labour Organization Administrative Tribunal (1946 →) • United Nations Administrative

Tribunal (1949 →) Appeal Board of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development  $(1950 \rightarrow)$ 

 Appeals Board of the Western European Union (1956 →)

• Council of Europe Appeals Board

Appeals Board of NATO (1965 →)

 Appeals Board of the Intergovernmental Committee for Migration (1972 →)

 Appeals Board of the European Space Agency (1975 →)

 Administrative Tribunal of the Organization of American States (19ॅ76 →) World Bank Administrative

Tribunal (1980 →)

Implementation Committee

under the Montreal Protocol

on Substances that Deplete

the Ozone Laver (1990 →)

• IMO Sub-committee on Flag

Implementation Committee

of the Protocols to the 1979

Transboundary Air Pollution

ECE Convention on Long-Range

State Implementation

EXISTING

(1992 →)

(1997 →)

## International Administrative Tribunals EXISTING

 Inter-American Development Bank Administrative Tribunal (1981 →)

International Monetary Fund Administrative Tribunal (1994 →)

Asian Development Bank Administrative Tribunal African Development Bank

Administrative Tribunal Latin American Integration Association Administrative Tribunal

## EXTINCT

(1966-1974)

Non-Compliance / Implementation Monitoring Bodies

NASCENT

Disposal

(1998)

League of Nations Administrative Tribunal (1927-1945)

Appeals Board of the European Space Research Organization (1966-1974) Appeals Board of the European Space Vehicle Launcher

Development Organization

Desertification Convention (1994)

Basel Convention on Control of

Aarhus Convention on Access to

Decision-making and Access to

Justice in Environmental Matters

Information, Public Participation in

Transboundary Movements of

Hazardous Wastes and their

Kvoto Protocol (1997)

# EXISTING

NASCENT

(2000)

Rotterdam Convention on the Prior

Informed Consent Procedure for

Pesticides in International Trade

Multilateral Consultative Process

for the United Nations Climate

Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety

· Stockholm Convention on Persisten

Change Convention (1998)

Organic Pollutants (2001)

Certain Hazardous Chemicals and

**Inspection Panels** · World Bank Inspection Panel (1994 →)

 Inter-American Development Bank Independent Investigation Mechanism (1995 →)

 Asian Development Bank Inspection Policy (1995 →) Claims of Displaced Persons

> Claims Resolution Tribunal for Dormant Accounts in Switzerland

#### EXISTING

German Forced Labour

 Marshall Islands Nuclear Claims Tribunal (1983 →)

 United Nations Compensation Commission (1991 →) Commission for Real Property

Iran-United States Claims

Tribunal (1980 →)

and Refugees (Bosnia and Herzegovina) (1995 →)

Compensation Programme (2000 →)

International Claims and Compensation Bodies - Multilateral / Bilateral

Eritrea-Ethiopia Claims

## FXTINCT American-Mexican Claims Commissions (1868, 1923 and 1924)

 Conciliation Commissions under the 1947 Peace Treaty with Italy (1947-1965\*)

UN Tribunal for Libya (1951-1955)

# UN Tribunal for Eritrea (1951-1954)

## · Property Commissions under the Peace Treaty with Japan

Debts (1953-1980\*)

(1951-1961\*) Arbitral Tribunal and Mixed Commission under the 1953 Londor Agreement on German External

Arbitral Commission on Property. Rights, and Interests in Germany (1956-1969)

 Austro-German Property Arbitral Tribunal (1961-1973)

#### This list is not exhaustive. but only illustrative. There are more than 80 mixed arbitral tribunals and claims commissions that were created in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries in the wake of armed conflicts and revolutions. Most of them were created in the

aftermath of World Wars I and II. This is the date in which the last award was made.

## Permanent Arbitral Tribunals/Conciliation Commissions

## EXISTING

(1997 →)

 Permanent Court of Arbitration (1899 →) International Joint Commission

(1909 →) Bank for International Settlements Arbitral Tribunal (1930 -

International Civil Aviation Organization Council (under the 1944 Chicago Convention the ICAO Council has certain dispute settlement competences) (1944 →)

 OAU Commission of Mediation. Conciliation and Arbitration (1964 → International Centre for the Settlement of Investment

 Gulf Cooperation Council Commission for the Settlement o Disputes (1981 →) Court of Arbitration for Sport

Disputes (1966 →)

(1984 →) North American Commission on Environmental Cooperation (1993-

## EXISTING

 OSCE Court of Conciliation and Arbitration (1994 →) NAFTA Dispute Settlement

Panels (1994 →) Arbitration and Mediation Center of the World Intellectual Propert Organization (1994 →)

## FXTINCT

 Upper Silesia Arbitral Tribunal (1922-1937)

## DORMANT

 Arbitral Tribunal of the Inter-governmental Organization for International Carriage by Rail (OTIF) (1890)

 Arbitral College of the Benelux Economic Union (1958)

 Court of Arbitration of the French Community (1959)

 Arbitration Tribunal of the Central American Common Market (1960)

## **Internationalized Criminal Courts and Tribunals**

## EXISTING

 Kosovo War and Ethnic Crimes Court (2000 →)

 United Nations Transitional Administration in East Timor -Prosecutor General (2000 →)

## NASCENT

 Special Court for Sierra Leone (2001) Extraordinary Chambers in the

# Courts of Cambodia (2001) PROPOSED

Special Court for Liberia

body nor an internationalized one. It was a Scottish court, applying Scottish criminal law. Unlike the bodies listed in this column, it did not carry out its functions under international supervision. Truth and reconciliation

The so-called Lockerhie Trial

Court was not an international

commissions (like the ones created for South Africa, Guatemala, Argentina etc.) are not listed in this chart because, although of international interest, they are essentially domestic endeavours.

## Version 2.0 (August, 2001)



# The International Judiciary in Context: A Synoptic Chart

The purpose of this chart is to provide international legal scholars and practitioners with a compendium of all international judicial bodies. Yet, this apparently straightforward task is riddled with traps and dilemmas. Perhaps the greatest challenge is to portray what can be called oxymoronically "an anarchic system" without exaggerating its level of order. The grouping and sub-grouping of all these bodies and mechanisms into a taxonomy does not imply the existence of an "international judicial system", if by system it is meant "a regularly interacting or interdependent group of items forming a unified whole" or "a functionally related group of elements" (Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, 10th ed.). Whether they ought to exist as a system is open to debate.

The second challenge is that in order to capture the dynamism and fluidity of the international judicial domain, any chart of the international judiciary needs to have a temporal dimension. Thus, alongside existing institutions, such as the International Court of Justice, the chart portrays bodies that have been closed down (labeled "extinct"), such as the Permanent Court of International Justice. There are also bodies provided for in treaties that never entered into force (aborted), such as the International Prize Court; idle ones like the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe's European Nuclear Energy Tribunal (dormant); and nascent bodies, like the International Criminal Court. Moreover, the synoptic chart also includes bodies that have been debated and remain confined to the realm of ideas, such as a possible International Court for the Environment (proposed). In sum, the chart depicts the past, present and potential make-up of the international judiciary.

The main focus of the chart is on international judicial bodies. On the top portion of the chart, there are 43 different institutions (of which only 16 are currently functioning) grouped by subject-matter jurisdiction in seven clusters. All the entities listed in this group meet certain fundamental criteria, which set them apart from all other entities listed in the bottom part of the chart. Namely, these entities:

- a) are permanent institutions;
- b) are composed of independent judges;
- adjudicate disputes between two or more entities, at least one of which is either a State or an International Organization;
- d) work on the basis of predetermined rules of procedure; and
- e) render decisions that are binding.

Altogether, these entities form the so-called "international judiciary". However, in order to fully understand the reasons for the rapid quantitative increase in the number of international judicial bodies, the extensive transformation of their competencies, and the success of certain subject-matter jurisdictions over others, it is necessary to include also those bodies and mechanisms which, while not meeting several or all of the above mentioned standards, also play a role in the enforcement, interpretation and implementation of international law. When these international judicial bodies are placed in a much larger historical and analytical context, 82 other entities and mechanisms, referred to as "Quasi-Judicial, Implementation Control and other Dispute Settlement Bodies", and gathered in seven autonomous clusters, need to be accounted for (excluding extinct International Claims and Compensation Bodies).

The institutions and mechanisms listed in this chart have very few legal or functional links among one another, either within or across each major grouping or cluster. Admittedly, until 1995 the International Court of Justice could review judgments of the United Nations Administrative Tribunal, but the link was then severed by the UN General Assembly. Certain institutions listed in the group "human rights bodies" (e.g., the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights) act as a mandatory filter for certain international courts and tribunals (in this case the Inter-American Court of Human Rights). Again, there are several cases of potentially competing "jurisdictions", both among bodies within the same group (e.g., the International Court of Justice and the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea) and bodies in different groups (e.g., the non-compliance procedures, the International Court of Justice or the World Trade Organization Dispute Settlement Body, to cite but a few). However, beyond such links, each institution is formally unrelated to any other.

Nonetheless, in their staggering diversity these 125 international bodies and mechanisms have certain commonalties that justify their presence on the same layout. First, all of these entities make legal determinations, and this sets them apart from other bodies, such as the UN General Assembly or the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, which share the same aspiration towards a "just world" but are of a quintessentially political nature. To be precise, these 125 bodies determine whether certain acts are congruous with certain norms. And this leads to a second commonality, which is the fact that in order to make their determinations they all resort to the same body of law: international law. Third, all of these international bodies have been established directly or indirectly (i.e., through a decision taken by a body established by treaty) by international agreements. It follows that they are subject to a legal order that is different from that of national systems, but, at the same time, that they are subject to (and materially dependent on) State support. Finally, and perhaps more importantly, collectively they are the expression of a widely shared need to abandon a world where only States count and the mighty rule, in favor of an order where certain fundamental common values are shared, protected and enforced by all members of a wide society, composed of States, International Organizations and individuals in all their legal incarnations (NGOs, peoples, corporations, natural persons, etc.).

Like any chart, this one is most likely incomplete. It is the result of an ongoing research effort carried out within PICT, and should be considered at best a partial representation of what exists, or has existed. Certain groupings have a mere illustrative function, for the enormous number of bodies that have been created in the past could not properly fit in the scheme. Other entries might change status in the near future, and new institutions and mechanisms might be created. Therefore, this chart will be updated regularly. To this end, any comments and suggestions will be greatly appreciated and can be sent to <cr28@acf2.nyu.edu>.

## Cesare P.R. Romano

### Note to Version 2.0

This is an updated version of the Synoptic Chart that was prepared in 1998 as a supplement to the special issue of the NYU Journal of International Law and Politics, Vol. 31, 4. That version listed 41 bodies in the top group and 55 in the bottom one. Some of the additions are new bodies that have been created or proposed since 1998, while others are simply past omissions that have been kindly pointed out by readers.

New features of this chart include a special category for "dormant bodies" and a new sub-grouping in the bottom part called "Internationalized Criminal Courts and Tribunals" (i.e., domestic criminal tribunals with international supervision created in the aftermath of regional and domestic armed conflicts, such as those for Sierra Leone, Kosovo, East Timor, and Cambodia). These are the latest additions to the multitude of bodies populating the international legal scene.